

## **SCRUTINY COMMITTEE**

**14 MARCH 2018**

### **PRESENT**

Councillor M. Young (in the Chair).

Councillors M. Cordingley (Vice-Chairman), R. Bowker, C. Boyes, K. Carter, Mrs. P. Dixon, J. Holden, M. Hyman, A. Mitchell, D. Western and A.M. Whyte

#### Also Present

Cllr Mrs. L. Evans - Executive Member for Communities & Partnerships  
Cllr D. Hopps - Executive Member for Housing and Strategic Planning  
Cllr B. Shaw - Executive Member for Highways, Parks & Environmental Services

#### In attendance

J. Le Fevre - Director of Legal & Democratic Services  
N. Bishop - Chief Finance Officer  
M. Wise - Director One Trafford Partnership  
P. Helsby - Director, Trafford Leisure CIC  
P. Forrester - Head of Governance  
I. Veitch - Head of Regulatory Services  
J. Cherrett - Chief Operating Officer, Trafford Leisure CIC  
T. Wilde - Social Investment Manager, Trafford Housing Trust  
C. Gaffey - Democratic & Scrutiny Officer

### **39. MINUTES**

RESOLVED: That the minutes of the meeting held on 10 January 2018, be agreed as a correct record and signed by the Chairman.

### **40. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

No declarations of interest were made by Members of the Committee.

### **41. ANNUAL DELIVERY PLAN 2017/18 - Q3 PERFORMANCE REPORT**

The Committee received a report of the Executive Member for Corporate Resources providing a summary of performance against the Council's Annual Delivery Plan (ADP), 2017/18. The report covered the period 1st October to 31st December 2017, and was presented by the Chief Finance Officer.

Members discussed the 'Safest Place to Live' indicator and whether this was sufficient in demonstrating whether performance was improving locally over time. The Executive Member for Communities and Partnerships agreed that this was an important issue to get right, and that consideration was being given to how this indicator could be more effectively reported. The Vice-Chairman advised that safety in Trafford may be considered as part of the Scrutiny Committee work programme for the coming municipal year, looking at anti-social behaviour and the work of the Youth Trust.

RESOLVED: That the report be noted.

**42. EXECUTIVE'S RESPONSE TO SCRUTINY COMMITTEE'S RECOMMENDATIONS TO THE BUDGET PROPOSALS FOR 2018/19**

The Committee received a joint report of the Executive Member for Corporate Resources and the Chief Finance Officer providing the Executive's formal response to the Scrutiny Committee's recommendations in relation to the 2018/19 Draft Budget Proposals.

The Chairman thanked the Executive for the response to the Committee's report and looked forward to updates against the report's recommendations during the 2018/19 municipal year. In relation to the Committee's request for information in advance of the Budget Scrutiny sessions, the Chairman noted that the Executive's response stated that this would be done 'when possible'. The Chairman advised that, due to the complexity and amount of detail within the budget, advance information would be essential to allow the Committee the required time to analyse the data and prepare accordingly. The Committee would therefore expect this information be provided in advance of the Budget Scrutiny sessions later this year.

RESOLVED: That the report be noted.

**43. LEISURE STRATEGY UPDATE**

The Committee received a report of the Executive Member, Communities and Partnerships providing an update on the Leisure Strategy's progress as a fundamental pillar of the Vision for 2031. The report covered progress on: the Physical Activity Strategy; the Playing Pitch Strategy; Leisure Centre Investment; and Trafford Leisure's Physical Activity Referral Scheme.

The Committee were shown a video of a successful case study of the GP referral scheme to accompany the report. It was noted that the scheme had been designed to be scalable in relation to demand, and that the scheme could be administered in parks and other green spaces, as well as in leisure centres. Trafford Leisure CIC were currently developing other products for the referral of different groups. It was noted that the scheme was a demand led model funded by Trafford Leisure CIC, and had a conversion rate of 64% of referrals continuing with the prescribed physical activity after their referral.

The Committee discussed the Playing Pitch Strategy and whether the proposed pitches could be used in winter. Members were advised that the Leisure Trust CIC were currently working with the Parklife Football Hubs Programme, developed by Sport England and the Football Association, to ensure that the most was made of the playing pitches in the borough.

Concerns were raised regarding the delay in the building of Altrincham Leisure Centre, which had been agreed in principle several years ago. The Committee were assured that the development would be going ahead and that funding for this had been ring-fenced. The Leisure Strategy was also focused on ongoing improvements at other facilities in the borough, but work on the Altrincham site would get underway as soon as practicably possible.

**Scrutiny Committee**  
**14 March 2018**

---

The Committee discussed the proposed development on the George H. Carnell site, recently announced at a meeting of full Council. Some Members questioned the decision to announce this at full Council before any consultation had been undertaken with local residents, and that Members required more information on the proposals. Members were advised that the details of the proposals were currently being finalised, and that further discussions would take place following this work. The Executive Member for Communities and Partnerships felt that the proposals should be welcomed. A new sporting team in the Manchester Giants would be located in Trafford, and the proposals would offer improved facilities in the area, outreach programmes, as well as new housing.

Members discussed the proposals at Turn Moss. Members advised that many residents did not feel that the proposals would deliver the community activity programme mentioned in the report. Members were advised that the land would be leased to Salford City Football Club. The Executive Member for Communities and Partnerships advised that the proposals would make the otherwise mostly unplayable pitches into usable facilities for local residents, and that a number of residents were in favour of the proposals. Members were advised that the planning application in relation to Turn Moss was currently in progress, and Members could find the three accompanying benefit statements on the Council's planning portal. There was a commitment to develop the final detail of the proposals with the community following the planning application, and many discussions were ongoing with local groups on how they wanted the land to be used. Members were also advised of the community benefits detailed in the report, and how this would align with the Council's Vision 2031 objectives.

The Vice Chairman suggested that the Leisure Trust widen its brief and should be an integral stakeholder for aspects other than just leisure facilities. For example they should be consulted on road changes which might stop people being so active in certain areas. It was also felt that more challenging targets should be set, especially in relation to the percentage of the population engaging in over 30 minutes for moderate exercise a week. The Vice Chairman felt that the Leisure and Playing Pitch Strategies alone might not be enough to achieve this, and that wider consideration of all aspects in relation to health and wellbeing was required. Members were reminded that Vision 2031 covered a large number of aspects in relation to health and wellbeing, including walking, cycling, the use of outside playing areas, and was not confined to the use of leisure centres, and looked at how people see how they want to get healthier, especially within the context of Trafford's aging population.

Members commented on the difficulty in finding formal information in relation to Vision 2031. It was noted that the Vision itself had not been published whilst it was still in development, and this would be launched following its finalisation. Care had been given to ensure full engagement with residents and stakeholders before the Vision and the outcomes it wished to achieve were agreed and published. Some Committee members raised their concerns that the Vision had been used to inform a number of recent reports, including the budget, but that this was not a formal document in the public domain. The Chairman agreed that it was important for this information to be made public, and looked forward to its publication in due course.

The Vice Chairman raised his concerns with the consultation process for the Stretford Masterplan, which included the proposals for Turn Moss, and felt that some aspects of the proposals, many of which were positive, were lost in discussions about more controversial aspects of the proposals. The Executive Member for Communities and Partnerships disagreed with the Vice Chairman's assessment, and felt that the consultation had been thorough and robust, highlighting the number of public meetings held and the amount of feedback received. The Vice Chairman advised that he would be putting the Council's consultation processes forward as an item for Scrutiny to consider in the coming municipal year.

The Committee discussed the Leisure Strategy's official launch, as mentioned in the report. It was noted that the Strategy would be launched over three days from Friday 3 April to Sunday 5 April 2018. The Friday would be an event to engage with stakeholders held at Lancashire County Cricket Club, and would be an opportunity to talk about Vision 2031 and how stakeholders and partners could get involved with helping the Council achieve the Vision's objectives. Saturday 4 April would be focused on engaging with the community, giving residents the opportunity to take part in activities at multiple areas across the borough. The 2018 Manchester Marathon would take place on Sunday 5 April. The three day event would be a celebration and an opportunity to get residents active, and would be advertised via many different channels, including contacting resident through Trafford's sports and physical activity partnership databases and social media.

RESOLVED: That the report be noted.

#### **44. SOCIAL INVESTMENT FRAMEWORK - TRAFFORD HOUSING TRUST**

The Committee received a report of the Social Investment Manager, Trafford Housing Trust, outlining the arrangements for Trafford Housing Trust's Social Investment Framework as well as an update on spend to date. It was noted that the current projected social dividend would be in the region of £2m per year, and that £10m of this would be ring-fenced for Trafford over the next 10 years. The Executive Member for Communities and Partnerships questioned this figure, as it was her understanding that 70% of the funds would be ring-fenced for Trafford. The Social Investment Manager agreed to look into this and get back to the Committee to confirm.

Members discussed the Social Investment Board and how its membership was selected. An application process was followed, with the best candidates selected to ensure that a balance of different members with varying skillsets were appointed. Although the majority of Board members were Trafford residents, Members were advised that geography was not a marker in the appointment process. Board Members were encouraged to make decisions based on the evidence of each application, and where Board members resided should not affect the decision making process. It was noted that all virtual Board members lived or worked in Trafford.

In relation to transparency, Members were advised that information on the Social Investment Board, including information on all investments, were published online,

and could be found on the websites listed on page 1 of the supplementary agenda. The website also included information on the progress of approved schemes, and work was ongoing to enhance this to provide even more detail.

The Committee asked questions in relation to any unallocated funds at the end of each financial year. It was expected to take two years to achieve the spending objective of £2m per financial year, and any funds committed by the end of the current financial year would carry over to the following year's budget. However, this might not be possible on a continuous basis. It was noted that the Social Investment Fund was advertised and promoted in a variety of ways, including targeted Facebook posts aimed at Trafford residents, to ensure members of the public and stakeholders were aware of it.

The Chairman requested that a further update be provided to the Committee in future.

RESOLVED: That the report be noted.

#### **45. HIGH RISE CLADDING UPDATE**

The Committee received a report of the Director of Growth and Regulatory Services, presented by the Executive Member for Housing and Strategic Planning, providing a further update on the current position in Trafford in relation to fire safety in high rise housing following the tragic events at Grenfell Tower. It was noted that the remedial work required on the tower blocks identified as having ACM cladding was scheduled for completion by autumn 2018, with temporary measures in place in the interim.

The Chairman thanked the Executive Member for the report and advised it was important that the Committee continued to receive updates on this matter.

RESOLVED: That the report be noted.

#### **46. UPDATE ON THE TASK AND FINISH GROUP REVIEW OF THE JOINT VENTURE CONTRACT BETWEEN TRAFFORD COUNCIL AND AMEY**

The Committee received a report of the Director of One Trafford Partnership, presented by the Executive Member for Highways, Parks and Environmental Services, providing an update on the progress made on 4 key recommendations arising from the Task and Finish Group Review of the Joint Venture Contract between Trafford Council and Amey.

The Chairman raised his concerns that the report had been requested for earlier Scrutiny meetings but had been delayed to the current meeting. Referring to recommendation 3 in the report, the Committee were disappointed that no reports detailing performance against the KPIs had been provided to the Executive, a request which was agreed by the Executive in June 2017. The failure to implement this recommendation, coupled with concerns raised by residents, was causing a great deal of disquiet with Members of the Committee. Members were advised that the 2016/17 KPI performance report was in the public domain and was available

**Scrutiny Committee**  
**14 March 2018**

---

on the Council's website. The 2017/18 performance details were yet to be published, as a significant amount of work was ongoing around the contract's performance. Members were advised that this report would be agreed and published at the end of the current financial year.

Members advised that they continued to receive complaints from residents, with many citing instances of reports being logged as 'complete' when this was not the case, and the lack of performance information available made it difficult for Ward Councillors to report back to their residents. The Committee felt that they were not receiving good quality information in relation to the contract.

The Executive Member for Highways, Parks and Environmental Services advised that many improvements were ongoing, with new technology currently being implemented to help map missed bin collections, as well as a new CRM implementation scheduled for 19 March. The Executive Member felt that information in relation to these changes were being communicated to Members. However, the Executive Member would be happy to look into what more could be included in updates to Members, as well as looking at expanding the information provided to the public even further.

Members requested that the Committee be provided with quarterly updates on Amey's performance, including information on complaints, so that they could assess the contract's performance and identify any trends. The Executive Member for Highways, Parks and Environmental Services agreed to look into this and get back to the Committee.

Members were advised that invitations to visit the facility at Tatton House would be circulated to all Members in the week commencing 19 March 2018.

The Committee noted the report, and would await the 2017/18 performance reports, as well as the first quarterly report for 2018/19, early in the next municipal year.

RESOLVED: That the report be noted.

**47. SCRUTINY COMMITTEE TASK & FINISH GROUP REVIEW OF THE COUNCIL'S SCRUTINY FUNCTION**

The Committee received a report of the Scrutiny Committee Task & Finish Group formed to conduct a review of the Council's Scrutiny Function. The item of urgent business raised under item 11 on the agenda (see minute 48) was considered in conjunction with this report.

It was noted that the Government's response to the original DCLG report and its recommendations had recently been published, but this did not fundamentally affect the Committee's report and its recommendations. The Government response confirmed that current guidance would be revised, but scrutiny arrangements would largely continue to be determined locally.

**Scrutiny Committee**  
**14 March 2018**

---

Members of the Task and Finish Group thanked the Chairman for the opportunity to conduct this review.

RESOLVED: That the report and its recommendations be endorsed by the Committee for referral to the Executive.

**48. URGENT BUSINESS (IF ANY)**

(a) Government Response to the Communities and Local Government Committee First Report of Session 2017-19 on the Effectiveness of Local Authority Overview and Scrutiny Committees

[The Chairman agreed to accept this item as a matter of urgent business to allow a timely update on the situation to Board members]

The Committee received the Government's response to the Communities and Local Government Committee First Report of Session 2017-19 on the Effectiveness of Local Authority Overview and Scrutiny Committees, which was considered in conjunction with item 10 on the agenda (see minute 47).

RESOLVED: That the report be noted.

The meeting commenced at 6.30 pm and finished at 8.13 pm